

Constructing JESUS

Memory, Imagination, and History

DALE C. ALLISON JR.


Baker Academic
a division of Baker Publishing Group
Grand Rapids, Michigan

© 2010 by Dale C. Allison Jr.

Published by Baker Academic
a division of Baker Publishing Group
P.O. Box 6287, Grand Rapids, MI 49516-6287
www.bakeracademic.com

Paperback edition published 2013
ISBN 978-0-8010-4875-3

Printed in the United States of America

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means—for example, electronic, photocopy, recording—without the prior written permission of the publisher. The only exception is brief quotations in printed reviews..

The Library of Congress has cataloged the hardcover edition as follows:
Allison, Dale C.

Constructing Jesus : memory, imagination, and history / Dale C. Allison, Jr.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and indexes.

ISBN 978-0-8010-3585-2 (cloth)

1. Jesus Christ—Historicity. I. Title.

BT303.2.A543 2010

232.9'08—dc22

2010016426

Bible quotations are from the RSV, NRSV, or are those of the author.

RSV stands for the Revised Standard Version of the Bible, copyright 1952 [2nd edition, 1971] by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America. Used by permission. All rights reserved.

NRSV stands for the New Revised Standard Version of the Bible, copyright © 1989, by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America. Used by permission. All rights reserved.

For Chris Kettler

Friends, although absent, are at hand.

—Cicero

Contents

Preface	ix
Abbreviations	xiii
1. The General and the Particular: Memories of Jesus	1
2. More Than a Sage: The Eschatology of Jesus	31
Excursus 1: The Kingdom of God and the World to Come	164
Excursus 2: The Continuity between John the Baptist and Jesus	204
3. More Than a Prophet: The Christology of Jesus	221
4. More Than an Aphorist: The Discourses of Jesus	305
5. Death and Memory: The Passion of Jesus	387
6. Memory and Invention: How Much History?	435
Bibliography	463
Ancient Writings Index	535
Author Index	567
Subject Index	583

Preface

This is my fourth and, I hope, final book on the historical Jesus. I never intended to produce more than a single slim volume. But one thing led to another, or rather one book to another. After the publication, in 1998, of *Jesus of Nazareth: Millenarian Prophet*, I received invitations to speak further on the subject, and I ran across responses to my work that called for clarification and commentary. And so, in 2005, another book was born, *Resurrecting Jesus*. The process then repeated itself—more invitations to speak, more clarifications to offer, more rejoinders to issue. The upshot has been two more books, one being *The Historical Christ and the Theological Jesus*, which appeared in 2009, the other being the present volume. That, however, should be the end of the line. Although the subject remains hypnotic, I have contributed more than my fair share of pages to this limitless field of controversy. It is time to move on to other things.

Chapter 1, which outlines and offers justification for the method I adopt throughout the rest of the book, is a much expanded version of a lecture delivered in the spring of 2009 at Yale University, to the department of religious studies. Thanks go to Dale Martin for making the arrangements and for his attentive hospitality.

Chapter 2 is an attempt to present, one last time, my case for Jesus as an apocalyptic prophet. Although it is the culmination of a series of contributions I have made to the subject over the past three decades, it also and more particularly grows out of a paper presented in April of 2007 at Princeton Theological Seminary for a symposium organized by James H. Charlesworth. The questions and comments that followed that address have helped me to improve greatly the present product. I wrote additional sections of chapter 2 in anticipation of a presentation for the annual meeting of the Jesus Seminar in March of 2010.

Excursus 1 is my attempt to rethink, in the light of a fresh review of Jewish materials, the meanings of “kingdom of God” in the Jesus tradition. It is intended to reinforce the major conclusions of chapter 2, as is excursus 2, a lightly revised version of portions of an article originally published as “The Continuity between John and Jesus,” in the *Journal for the Study of the Historical Jesus* 1, no. 1 (2003): 6–27. I thank Brill and the editor of that journal, Robert Webb, for permission to use copyrighted materials.

Chapter 3, on the genesis of Christology, presupposes the results of chapter 2 and is entirely new. It gives me the opportunity to address an exceedingly controversial matter that, despite my keen, long-standing interest, I have heretofore written about only in passing. I have tried hard not to repeat what others have said before, and because of this I have even at points allowed myself the freedom to speculate well beyond the evidence; nonetheless, some recapitulation on this topic, as on others in this volume, has proven inevitable.

Chapter 4 builds upon two previous studies. In *The Jesus Tradition in Q* (Trinity Press International, 1997), I observed that some of the literary features in the Sermon on the Plain appear also in extracanonical parallels to Luke 6; and in *The Intertextual Jesus* (Trinity Press International, 2000), I argued that the middle portion of that sermon is largely a rewrite of Lev 19 and attendant traditions. The present volume offers me the chance to bring my earlier claims together and to unfold their large implications for the history of Q’s inaugural discourse.

Chapter 5 applies the method introduced in chapter 1 to a famous crux: how did Jesus face his death? My intention is not only to suggest an approach to that fascinating question but also to contribute to our understanding of the origin and evolution of the pre-Markan passion narrative.

Chapter 6, which addresses a fundamental issue too often neglected, reproduces the plenary address for the annual meeting of the Central States Region of the Society of Biblical Literature, held in Saint Louis on March 29, 2009. I happily thank Brad Chance, Milton Horne, and Steve Patterson for the invitation and their welcome on that pleasant occasion.

This volume as a whole is testimony to my conviction that the means that most scholars have employed and continue to employ for constructing the historical Jesus are too flimsy to endure, or at least too flimsy for me to countenance any longer. I learned the discipline during an era when everyone was taught to employ the so-called criteria of authenticity. We were to find Jesus by, first, isolating individual units and then, second, running them through a gauntlet consisting of multiple attestation, dissimilarity, embarrassment, and so on. After many years of playing by the rules, however, I have gradually come to abandon them. I have decided that knowing the old directives has been of much less help than promised. I am trying something else. This book is the result.

My wife, Kristine Allison, and my administrative assistant, Kathy Anderson, read through the entire manuscript. Chris Kettler, Nancy Klancher, Joel Marcus, and Mike Winger commented on portions of it. Their eyes have caught seemingly countless errors both large and small, and their questions have led me to revise some of my judgments—all, no doubt, for the better. I am most grateful to them, as also to James Ernest, who helped me first form the vision for this book and who, along with Wells Turner in the editorial process, greatly improved it.

I dedicate this book to my longtime friend Chris Kettler, who has had the good sense and good fortune to spend most of his life in my favorite place, among some of my favorite people. He understands: history is not theology.

Abbreviations

General

ad loc.	at the place discussed	<i>pace</i>	contrary to the opinion of
a.k.a.	also known as	par.	parallel
<i>apud</i>	according to, in the writings of	p(p.)	page(s)
<i>bis</i>	twice	Q	<i>Quelle</i> (German for “source”), putative source of the sayings of Jesus appearing in Matthew and Luke
col.	column	R.	Rabbi
diff.	differs from	RecLng	long recension
esp.	especially	RecShrt	short recension
fol.	folio	repr.	reprint
frg(s).	fragment(s)	rev.	revised
Gk.	Greek	s.v.	under the word
ibid.	in the same source	v.l.	variant reading
idem	by the same author	v(v).	verse(s)
inv.	inventory number		
Lat.	Latin		
n.d.	no date		

Ancient Texts, Text Types, and Versions

LXX	Septuagint	Tg.	Targum
MT	Masoretic Text	Θ	Theodotion

Modern Editions

NA²⁷ *Novum Testamentum Graece*. Edited by [E. and E. Nestle], B. Aland, K. Aland, J. Karavidopoulos, C. M. Martini, and B. M. Metzger. 27th rev. ed. Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1993

Modern Versions

KJV	King James Version
NRSV	New Revised Standard Version
RSV	Revised Standard Version

Papyri

PFlor.	Papiri Fiorentini	P.Oxy.	Oxyrhynchus Papyri
PHeid.	Heidelberger Papyrussammlung	P.Vindob.	Einige Wiener Papyri

Hebrew Bible / Old Testament

Gen	Genesis	Neh	Nehemiah	Hos	Hosea
Exod	Exodus	Esth	Esther	Joel	Joel
Lev	Leviticus	Job	Job	Amos	Amos
Num	Numbers	Ps/Pss	Psalms	Obad	Obadiah
Deut	Deuteronomy	Prov	Proverbs	Jonah	Jonah
Josh	Joshua	EccI	Ecclesiastes	Mic	Micah
Judg	Judges	Song	Song of Songs	Nah	Nahum
Ruth	Ruth	Isa	Isaiah	Hab	Habakkuk
1–2 Sam	1–2 Samuel	Jer	Jeremiah	Zeph	Zephaniah
1–2 Kgs	1–2 Kings	Lam	Lamentations	Hag	Haggai
1–2 Chr	1–2 Chronicles	Ezek	Ezekiel	Zech	Zechariah
Ezra	Ezra	Dan	Daniel	Mal	Malachi

New Testament

Matt	Matthew	1–2 Thess	1–2 Thessalonians
Mark	Mark	1–2 Tim	1–2 Timothy
Luke	Luke	Titus	Titus
John	John	Phlm	Philemon
Acts	Acts	Heb	Hebrews
Rom	Romans	Jas	James
1–2 Cor	1–2 Corinthians	1–2 Pet	1–2 Peter
Gal	Galatians	1–2–3 John	1–2–3 John
Eph	Ephesians	Jude	Jude
Phil	Philippians	Rev	Revelation
Col	Colossians		

Apocrypha and Septuagint

Bar	Baruch	Sir	Sirach
1–2 Esd	1–2 Esdras	Tob	Tobit
Jdt	Judith	Wis	Wisdom of Solomon
1–4 Macc	1–4 Maccabees		

Old Testament Pseudepigrapha

<i>Ahiqar</i>	<i>Ahiqar</i>	<i>Ps.-Phoc.</i>	<i>Pseudo-Phocylides</i>
<i>Apoc. Ab.</i>	<i>Apocalypse of Abraham</i>	<i>Pss. Sol.</i>	<i>Psalms of Solomon</i>
<i>Apoc. Adam</i>	<i>Apocalypse of Adam</i>	<i>Sib. Or.</i>	<i>Sybilline Oracles</i>
<i>Apoc. El.</i>	<i>Apocalypse of Elijah</i>	<i>Syr. Apoc. Dan.</i>	<i>Syriac Apocalypse of Daniel</i>
<i>Apoc. Sedr.</i>	<i>Apocalypse of Sedrach</i>	<i>Syr. Men.</i>	<i>Sentences of the Syriac Menander</i>
<i>As. Mos.</i>	<i>Assumption of Moses</i>	<i>T. Ab.</i>	<i>Testament of Abraham</i>
<i>2 Bar.</i>	<i>2 Baruch (Syriac Apocalypse)</i>	<i>T. Adam</i>	<i>Testament of Adam</i>
<i>3 Bar.</i>	<i>3 Baruch (Greek Apocalypse)</i>	<i>T. Ash.</i>	<i>Testament of Asher</i>
<i>4 Bar.</i>	<i>4 Baruch (Paraleipomena Jeremiou)</i>	<i>T. Benj.</i>	<i>Testament of Benjamin</i>
<i>1 En.</i>	<i>1 Enoch (Ethiopic Apocalypse)</i>	<i>T. Dan</i>	<i>Testament of Dan</i>
<i>2 En.</i>	<i>2 Enoch (Slavonic Apocalypse)</i>	<i>T. Gad</i>	<i>Testament of Gad</i>
<i>3 En.</i>	<i>3 Enoch (Hebrew Apocalypse)</i>	<i>T. Isaac</i>	<i>Testament of Isaac</i>
<i>4 Ezra</i>	<i>4 Ezra</i>	<i>T. Iss.</i>	<i>Testament of Issachar</i>
<i>Gk. Apoc. Ezra</i>	<i>Greek Apocalypse of Ezra</i>	<i>T. Jac.</i>	<i>Testament of Jacob</i>
<i>Jos. Asen.</i>	<i>Joseph and Aseneth</i>	<i>T. Job</i>	<i>Testament of Job</i>
<i>Jub.</i>	<i>Jubilees</i>	<i>T. Jos.</i>	<i>Testament of Joseph</i>
<i>L.A.B.</i>	<i>Liber antiquitatum biblicalium (Pseudo-Philo)</i>	<i>T. Jud.</i>	<i>Testament of Judah</i>
<i>L.A.E.</i>	<i>Life of Adam and Eve</i>	<i>T. Levi</i>	<i>Testament of Levi</i>
<i>Let. Arist.</i>	<i>Letter of Aristaeus</i>	<i>T. Mos.</i>	<i>Testament of Moses</i>
<i>Liv. Pro.</i>	<i>Lives of the Prophets</i>	<i>T. Naph.</i>	<i>Testament of Naphtali</i>
<i>Mart. Ascen. Isa.</i>	<i>Martyrdom and Ascension of Isaiah</i>	<i>T. Reub.</i>	<i>Testament of Reuben</i>
<i>Pr. Jos.</i>	<i>Prayer of Joseph</i>	<i>T. Sol.</i>	<i>Testament of Solomon</i>
		<i>T. 3 Patr.</i>	<i>Testaments of the Three Patriarchs</i>
		<i>T. 12 Patr.</i>	<i>Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs</i>
		<i>T. Zeb.</i>	<i>Testament of Zebulun</i>

Dead Sea Scrolls and Related Texts

CD-A	<i>Damascus Document^a</i>	CD-B	<i>Damascus Document^b</i>
------	--------------------------------------	------	--------------------------------------

Mur 24	<i>papFarming Contracts</i>	4Q300 (4QMyst ^b)	<i>Mysteries^b</i>
1QH ^a	<i>Hodayot^a</i>	4Q377 (4Qapocr-Pent B)	<i>Apocryphon Penta-teuch B</i>
1QM	<i>War Scroll</i>	4Q381	<i>Non-Canonical Psalms B</i>
1QpHab	<i>Pesher to Habakkuk</i>	4Q385 (4QpsEzek ^a)	<i>Pseudo-Ezekiel^a</i>
1QS	<i>Rule of the Community</i>	4Q386 (4QpsEzek ^b)	<i>Pseudo-Ezekiel^b</i>
1Q28a (1QSa)	<i>Rule of the Congregation</i>	4Q398 (4QMMT ^c)	<i>Halakhic Letter^c</i>
1Q28b (1QSb)	<i>Rule of Benedictions</i>	4Q399 (4QMMT ^f)	<i>Halakhic Letter^f</i>
4Q161 (4QpIsa ^a)	<i>Isaiah Pesher^a</i>	4Q400 (4QShirShabb ^a)	<i>Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice^a</i>
4Q164 (4QpIsa ^d)	<i>Isaiah Pesher^d</i>	4Q403 (4QShirShabb ^d)	<i>Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice^d</i>
4Q174 (4QFlor)	<i>Florilegium</i>	4Q405 (4QShirShabb ^f)	<i>Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice^f</i>
4Q175 (4QTest)	<i>Testimonia</i>	4Q417	<i>Instruction^c</i>
4Q181 (4QAgesCreat B)	<i>Ages of Creation B</i>	4Q426	<i>Sapiential-Hymnic Work A</i>
4Q185	<i>Sapiential Work</i>	4Q427 (4QH ^a)	<i>Hodayot^a</i>
4Q203 (4QEn-Giants ^a ar)	<i>Book of Giants^a ar</i>	4Q471b	<i>Self-Glorification Hymn^a</i>
4Q225 (4QpsJub ^a)	<i>Pseudo-Jubilees^a</i>	4Q491 (4QM ^a)	<i>War Scroll^a</i>
4Q242 (4QPrNab ar)	<i>Prayer of Nabonidus ar</i>	4Q504 (4QDibHam ^a)	<i>Words of the Luminaries^a</i>
4Q243 (4QpsDan ^a ar)	<i>Pseudo-Daniel^a ar</i>	4Q509+4Q505 (4QpapPrFêtesc)	<i>Festival Prayers^c</i>
4Q244 (4QpsDan ^b ar)	<i>Pseudo-Daniel^b ar</i>	4Q511 (4QShir ^b)	<i>Songs of the Sage^b</i>
4Q245 (4QpsDan ^c ar)	<i>Pseudo-Daniel^c ar</i>	4Q521	<i>Messianic Apocalypse</i>
4Q246	<i>Aramaic Apocalypse</i>	4Q525 (4QBéat)	<i>Beatitudes</i>
4Q252 (4Qcomm-Gen A)	<i>Commentary on Genesis A</i>	4Q554 (4QNj ^a ar)	<i>New Jerusalem^a ar</i>
4Q264 (4QS ⁱ)	<i>Rule of the Communityⁱ</i>	4Q558	<i>Vision^b ar</i>
4Q285 (4QSM)	<i>Sefer ha-Milhamah</i>	4Q559 (4QpapBib-Chronology ar)	<i>Biblical Chronology</i>
4Q286 (4QBer ^a)	<i>Blessings^a</i>	11Q5 (11QPs ^a)	<i>Psalms^a</i>
4Q287 (4QBer ^b)	<i>Blessings^b</i>	11Q13 (11QMelch)	<i>Melchizedek</i>
		11Q19 (11QT ^a)	<i>Temple^a</i>

Targumic Texts

Frg. Tg.	Fragmentary Targum	Tg. Onq.	Targum Onqelos
Tg. Isa.	Targum Isaiah	Tg. Ps.-J.	Targum Pseudo-Jonathan
Tg. Neof. I	Targum Neofiti I		

Mishnah, Talmud, and Related Literature

<i>b.</i>	Babylonian Talmud	<i>ʿEd.</i>	<i>ʿEduyyot</i>	<i>Pesaḥ.</i>	<i>Pesaḥim</i>
		<i>ʿErub.</i>	<i>ʿErubin</i>	<i>Qidd.</i>	<i>Qidduṣin</i>
<i>m.</i>	Mishnah	<i>Giṭ.</i>	<i>Giṭṭin</i>	<i>Roš. Haš.</i>	<i>Roš Haššanah</i>
<i>t.</i>	Tosefta	<i>Ḥag.</i>	<i>Ḥagigah</i>	<i>Šabb.</i>	<i>Šabbat</i>
<i>y.</i>	Jerusalem Talmud	<i>Ḥul.</i>	<i>Ḥullin</i>	<i>Sanh.</i>	<i>Sanhedrin</i>
		<i>Kelim</i>	<i>Kelim</i>	<i>Šeqal.</i>	<i>Šeqalim</i>
		<i>Ketub.</i>	<i>Ketubim</i>	<i>Soṭah</i>	<i>Soṭah</i>
<i>ʿAbod. Zar.</i>	<i>ʿAbodah Zarah</i>	<i>Kil.</i>	<i>Kilʿayim</i>	<i>Sukkah</i>	<i>Sukkah</i>
<i>ʿAbot</i>	<i>ʿAbot</i>	<i>Maʿaš.</i>	<i>Maʿaserot</i>	<i>Taʿan.</i>	<i>Taʿanit</i>
<i>ʿArak.</i>	<i>ʿArakin</i>	<i>Meg.</i>	<i>Megillah</i>	<i>Tamid</i>	<i>Tamid</i>
<i>B. Bat.</i>	<i>Baba Batra</i>	<i>Menaḥ.</i>	<i>Menaḥot</i>	<i>Tem.</i>	<i>Temurah</i>
<i>Ber.</i>	<i>Berakot</i>	<i>Moʿed</i>	<i>Moʿed Qaṭan</i>	<i>Yebam.</i>	<i>Yebamot</i>
<i>B. Mešiʿa</i>	<i>Baba Mešiʿa</i>	<i>Qaṭ.</i>		<i>Yoma</i>	<i>Yoma (=</i> <i>Kippurim)</i>
<i>B. Qam.</i>	<i>Baba Qamma</i>	<i>Ned.</i>	<i>Nedarim</i>	<i>Zebaḥ.</i>	<i>Zebaḥim</i>
		<i>Peʿah</i>	<i>Peʿah</i>		

Other Rabbinic Works

<i>ʿAbot R. Nat.</i>	<i>ʿAbot de Rabbi Nathan</i>	<i>Sipra</i>	<i>Sipra</i>
<i>Mek.</i>	<i>Mekilta</i>	<i>Sipre</i>	<i>Sipre</i>
<i>Midr.</i>	<i>Midrash</i>	<i>Sop.</i>	<i>Soperim</i>
<i>Pesiq. Rab.</i>	<i>Pesiqta Rabbati</i>	<i>Tan. d. El.</i>	<i>Tanna debe Eliyahu</i>
<i>Pesiq. Rab Kab.</i>	<i>Pesiqta de Rab Kahana</i>	<i>Tanḥ.</i>	<i>Tanḥuma</i>
<i>Pirqe R. El.</i>	<i>Pirqe Rabbi Eliezer</i>	<i>Yal.</i>	<i>Yalquṭ</i>
<i>Rab.</i>	<i>Rabbah</i>		

Apostolic Fathers

<i>Barn.</i>	<i>Barnabas</i>	<i>Ign. Pol.</i>	<i>Ignatius, To Polycarp</i>
<i>1–2 Clem.</i>	<i>1–2 Clement</i>	<i>Ign. Rom.</i>	<i>Ignatius, To the Romans</i>
<i>Did.</i>	<i>Didache</i>	<i>Ign. Smyrn.</i>	<i>Ignatius, To the Smyrnaeans</i>
<i>Diogn.</i>	<i>Diognetus</i>	<i>Ign. Trall.</i>	<i>Ignatius, To the Trallians</i>
<i>Hermas, Sim.</i>	<i>Shepherd of Hermas, Similitude</i>	<i>Mart. Pol.</i>	<i>Martyrdom of Polycarp</i>
<i>Ign. Eph.</i>	<i>Ignatius, To the Ephesians</i>	<i>Pol. Phil.</i>	<i>Polycarp, To the Philippians</i>
<i>Ign. Magn.</i>	<i>Ignatius, To the Magnesians</i>		

Nag Hammadi Codices

<i>Dial. Sav.</i>	III,5 <i>Dialogue of the Savior</i>	<i>Thom. Cont.</i>	II,7 <i>Book of Thomas the Contender</i>
<i>Gos. Phil.</i>	II,3 <i>Gospel of Philip</i>	<i>Treat. Res.</i>	I,4 <i>Treatise on Resurrection</i>

New Testament Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha

<i>Acts Andr. Mth.</i>	<i>Acts of Andrew and Matthias</i>	<i>Gos. Pet.</i>	<i>Gospel of Peter</i>
<i>Acts John</i>	<i>Acts of John</i>	<i>Gos. Sav.</i>	<i>Gospel of the Savior</i>
<i>Acts Paul</i>	<i>Acts of Paul</i>	<i>Gos. Thom.</i>	<i>Gospel of Thomas</i>
<i>Acts Pil.</i>	<i>Acts of Pilate</i>	<i>Inf. Gos. Thom.</i>	<i>Infancy Gospel of Thomas</i>
<i>Acts Thom.</i>	<i>Acts of Thomas</i>	<i>Pist. Soph.</i>	<i>Pistis Sophia</i>
<i>Apoc. Paul</i>	<i>Apocalypse of Paul</i>	<i>Prot. Jas.</i>	<i>Protevangelium of James</i>
<i>Apoc. Pet.</i>	<i>Apocalypse of Peter</i>	<i>Ps.-Clem. Hom.</i>	<i>Pseudo-Clementine Homilies</i>
<i>Apos. Con.</i>	<i>Apostolic Constitutions and Canons</i>	<i>Ps.-Clem. Rec.</i>	<i>Pseudo-Clementine Recognitions</i>
<i>Ep. Apost.</i>	<i>Epistula Apostolorum</i>		
<i>Gos. Naz.</i>	<i>Gospel of the Nazarenes</i>		
<i>Gos. Nic.</i>	<i>Gospel of Nicodemus</i>		

Greek and Latin Works

Adamantius

<i>Dial.</i>	<i>Dialogue (De recta in Deum fide) (On True Faith in God)</i>
--------------	--

Ambrose

<i>Exp. Luc.</i>	<i>Expositio Evangelii secundum Lucam</i>
------------------	---

Ambrosiaster

<i>Comm. Rom.</i>	<i>Commentary on Romans</i>
-------------------	-----------------------------

Aristides

<i>Apol.</i>	<i>Apology</i>
--------------	----------------

Aristophanes

<i>Ran.</i>	<i>Ranae (Frogs)</i>
-------------	----------------------

Artemidorus

<i>Onir.</i>	<i>Onirocritica</i>
--------------	---------------------

Athanasius

<i>Vit. Ant.</i>	<i>Vita Antonii (Life of Antony)</i>
------------------	--------------------------------------

Augustine

<i>Civ.</i>	<i>De civitate Dei (The City of God)</i>
<i>Doctr. chr.</i>	<i>De doctrina christiana (Christian Instruction)</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae (Letters)</i>

<i>Exp. Gal.</i>	<i>Expositio in epistulam ad Galatas</i>
<i>Serm. Dom.</i>	<i>De sermone Domini in monte (Sermon on the Mount)</i>
<i>Trin.</i>	<i>De Trinitate</i>

Babrius

<i>Fab.</i>	<i>Fabulae Aesopeae</i>
-------------	-------------------------

Basil of Caesarea

<i>Comm. Isa.</i>	<i>Commentary on Isaiah</i>
<i>Reg. br.</i>	<i>Regulae brevius tractatae (Shorter Rules)</i>

Bede

<i>Comm. Acts</i>	<i>Commentary on Acts</i>
-------------------	---------------------------

Cassiodorus

<i>Exp. Ps.</i>	<i>Expositio psalmorum</i>
-----------------	----------------------------

Chrysostom

<i>Hom. 1 Cor.</i>	<i>Homiliae in epistulam i ad Corinthios</i>
<i>Hom. Eph.</i>	<i>Homiliae in epistulam ad Ephesios</i>
<i>Hom. Jo.</i>	<i>Homiliae in Joannem</i>
<i>Hom. Matt.</i>	<i>Homiliae in Matthaenum</i>
<i>Hom. Rom.</i>	<i>Homiliae in epistulam ad Romanos</i>
<i>Leg.</i>	<i>De legislatore</i>

Cicero

<i>De or.</i>	<i>De oratore</i>
---------------	-------------------

Clement of Alexandria

<i>Paed.</i>	<i>Paedagogus (Christ the Educator)</i>
<i>Prot.</i>	<i>Protrepticus (Exhortation to the Greeks)</i>
<i>Quis div.</i>	<i>Quis dives salvetur (Salvation of the Rich)</i>
<i>Strom.</i>	<i>Stromata (Miscellanies)</i>

Commodian

<i>Inst.</i>	<i>Instructiones adversus gentium deos pro christiana disciplina</i>
--------------	--

Cyprian

<i>Dom. or.</i>	<i>De dominica oratione</i>
-----------------	-----------------------------

Cyril of Alexandria

<i>Comm. Isa.</i>	<i>Commentary on Isaiah</i>
<i>Comm. Luke</i>	<i>Commentary on Luke</i>
<i>Hom. Luke</i>	<i>Homilies on Luke</i>

Didymus of Alexandria

<i>Fr. Ps.</i>	<i>Fragmenta in Psalmos</i>
----------------	-----------------------------

Dio Cassius

<i>Hist.</i>	<i>Roman History</i>
--------------	----------------------

Diogenes Laertius

<i>Vit.</i>	<i>Vitae philosophorum (Lives of Eminent Philosophers)</i>
-------------	--

Ephraem

<i>Comm. Exod.</i>	<i>Commentary on Exodus</i>
--------------------	-----------------------------

Epiphanius

<i>Pan.</i>	<i>Panarion (Refutation of All Heresies)</i>
-------------	--

Eusebius

<i>Dem. ev.</i>	<i>Demonstratio evangelica (Demonstration of the Gospel)</i>
<i>Hist. eccl.</i>	<i>Historia ecclesiastica (Ecclesiastical History)</i>
<i>Mart. Pal.</i>	<i>De martyribus Palaestinae (The Martyrs of Palestine)</i>
<i>Onom.</i>	<i>Onomasticon</i>
<i>Praep. ev.</i>	<i>Praeparatio evangelica (Preparation for the Gospel)</i>

Gregory of Nyssa		<i>Vit. Paul.</i>	<i>Vita S. Pauli, primi eremitae</i>
<i>Vit. Mos.</i>	<i>Vita Mosis</i>		
Haymo of Halberstadt		Josephus	
<i>Exp. Rom.</i>	<i>Expositio in epistulam ad Romanos</i>	<i>Ag. Ap.</i>	<i>Against Apion</i>
		<i>Ant.</i>	<i>Jewish Antiquities</i>
		<i>J.W.</i>	<i>Jewish War</i>
Herodotus		Justin	
<i>Hist.</i>	<i>Historiae (Histories)</i>	<i>1 Apol.</i>	<i>Apologia i (First Apology)</i>
		<i>2 Apol.</i>	<i>Apologia ii (Second Apology)</i>
		<i>Dial.</i>	<i>Dialogus cum Tryphone (Dialogue with Trypho)</i>
Hippolytus		Lactantius	
<i>Comm. Dan.</i>	<i>Commentarium in Daniele</i>	<i>Epit.</i>	<i>Epitome divinarum institutionum (Epitome of the Divine Institutes)</i>
<i>Haer.</i>	<i>Refutatio omnium haeresium (Refutation of All Heresies)</i>		
Horace		Livy	
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae (Epistles)</i>	<i>Hist.</i>	<i>History of Rome</i>
Irenaeus		Longinus	
<i>Epid.</i>	<i>Epideixis tou apostolikou kerygmatos (Demonstration of the Apostolic Preaching)</i>	<i>Subl.</i>	<i>De sublimitate (On the Sublime)</i>
<i>Haer.</i>	<i>Adversus haereses (Against Heresies)</i>		
Isbo'dad of Merv		Marius Victorinus	
<i>Comm. Luke</i>	<i>Commentary on Luke</i>	<i>Comm. Gal.</i>	<i>Commentary on Galatians</i>
Isocrates		Oecumenius of Trikka	
<i>Ad Nic.</i>	<i>Ad Nicoclem (Or. 2)</i>	<i>Frag. 1 Cor.</i>	<i>Fragmenta in epistulam i ad Corinthios</i>
<i>Aeginet.</i>	<i>Aegineticus (Or. 19)</i>		
<i>Demon.</i>	<i>Ad Demonicum (Or. 1)</i>	Origen	
Jerome		<i>Cels.</i>	<i>Contra Celsum (Against Celsus)</i>
<i>Comm. Eph.</i>	<i>Commentariorum in epistulam ad Ephesios libri III</i>	<i>Comm. Jo.</i>	<i>Commentarii in evangelium Joannis</i>
<i>Comm. Gal.</i>	<i>Commentariorum in epistulam ad Galatas libri III</i>	<i>Comm. Matt.</i>	<i>Commentarium in evangelium Matthaei</i>
<i>Comm. Matt.</i>	<i>Commentariorum in Matthaeum libri IV</i>	<i>Hom. Jer.</i>	<i>Homiliae in Jeremiam</i>
		<i>Hom. Jos.</i>	<i>Homiliae in Josuam</i>

<i>Hom. Luc.</i>	<i>Homiliae in Lucam</i>
<i>Hom. Num.</i>	<i>Homiliae in Numeros</i>
<i>Mart.</i>	<i>Exhortatio ad martyrium (Exhortation to Martyrdom)</i>
<i>Princ.</i>	<i>De principiis (Peri archōn) (First Principles)</i>

Paschasius Radbertus

<i>Exp. Matt.</i>	<i>Expositio in evangelium Matthaei</i>
-------------------	---

Pelagius

<i>Comm. 1 Cor.</i>	<i>Commentary on 1 Corinthians</i>
<i>Comm. Eph.</i>	<i>Commentary on Ephesians</i>
<i>Comm. Rom.</i>	<i>Commentary on Romans</i>

Petronius

<i>Satyr.</i>	<i>Satyricon</i>
---------------	------------------

Philo

<i>Abraham</i>	<i>On the Life of Abraham</i>
<i>Alleg. Interp.</i>	<i>Allegorical Interpretation</i>
<i>Confusion</i>	<i>On the Confusion of Tongues</i>
<i>Dreams</i>	<i>On Dreams</i>
<i>Drunkenness</i>	<i>On Drunkenness</i>
<i>Embassy</i>	<i>On the Embassy to Gaius</i>
<i>Flight</i>	<i>On Flight and Finding</i>
<i>Giants</i>	<i>On Giants</i>
<i>God</i>	<i>On God</i>
<i>Good Person</i>	<i>That Every Good Person Is Free</i>
<i>Hypothetica</i>	<i>Hypothetica</i>
<i>Moses</i>	<i>On the Life of Moses</i>
<i>Posterity</i>	<i>On the Posterity of Cain</i>
<i>QG</i>	<i>Questions and Answers on Genesis</i>
<i>Rewards</i>	<i>On Rewards and Punishments</i>
<i>Spec. Laws</i>	<i>On the Special Laws</i>
<i>Virtues</i>	<i>On the Virtues</i>
<i>Worse</i>	<i>That the Worse Attacks the Better</i>

Photius

<i>Frag. Gal.</i>	<i>Fragmenta in epistulam ad Galatas</i>
-------------------	--

Plato

<i>Phaed.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
<i>Phaedr.</i>	<i>Phaedrus</i>
<i>Theaet.</i>	<i>Theaetetus</i>

Pliny the Younger

<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae</i>
------------	------------------

Plutarch

<i>Alex.</i>	<i>Alexander</i>
<i>Mor.</i>	<i>Moralia</i>
<i>Pomp.</i>	<i>Pompeius</i>

Pseudo-Justin

<i>Quaest. et resp.</i>	<i>Quaestiones et responsiones ad orthodoxos</i>
-------------------------	--

Quintilian

<i>Inst.</i>	<i>Institutio oratoria</i>
<i>Rhet. Her.</i>	<i>Rhetorica ad Herennium</i>

Sedulius Scottus

<i>Comm. Matt.</i>	<i>Commentary on Matthew</i>
--------------------	------------------------------

Seneca

<i>Ben.</i>	<i>De beneficiis</i>
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae morales</i>

Severian of Gabala

<i>Frag. 1 Cor.</i>	<i>Fragmenta in epistulam i ad Corinthios</i>
---------------------	---

Sextus

<i>Sent.</i>	<i>Sentences</i>
--------------	------------------

Socrates Scholasticus

Hist. eccl. *Historia ecclesiastica*
 (Ecclesiastical History)

Suetonius

Aug. *Divus Augustus*
Cal. *Gaius Caligula*
Dom. *Domitianus*
Vesp. *Vespasianus*

Tacitus

Ann. *Annales*
Hist. *Historiae*

Tertullian

An. *De anima*
Apol. *Apologeticus (Apology)*
Bapt. *De baptismo (Baptism)*
Carn. Chr. *De carne Christi (The*
 Flesh of Christ)
Marc. *Adversus Marcionem*
 (Against Marcion)
Or. *De oratione (Prayer)*
Pat. *De patientia (Patience)*
Praescr. *De praescriptione hae-*
 reticorum (Prescription
 against Heretics)
Prax. *Adversus Praxean*
 (Against Praxeas)
Scap. *Ad Scapulam*

Theodore of Heraclea

Comm. Matt. *Commentary on Matthew*

Theodoret of Cyrus

Comm. Col. *Commentary on*
 Colossians
Comm. 1 Cor. *Commentary on*
 1 Corinthians
Comm. Gal. *Commentary on*
 Galatians
Comm. Heb. *Commentary on Hebrews*
Comm. Rom. *Commentary on Romans*

Theophylact

Comm. Luke *Commentary on Luke*
Comm. Matt. *Commentary on Matthew*
Exp. 1 Cor. *Exposition of*
 1 Corinthians
Exp. Eph. *Exposition of Ephesians*
Exp. Rom. *Exposition of Romans*

Thomas Aquinas

Comm. Eph. *Commentary on*
 Ephesians
Comm. Gal. *Commentary on*
 Galatians

Thucydides

Hist. *History of the Pelopon-*
 nesian War

Xenophon

Hell. *Hellenica*

Other Ancient Works

CMC *Cologne Mani Codex*
Keph. *The Kephalaia of the Teacher*

Secondary Sources

AAJRP *American Academy of Jewish Research Proceedings*
AASF *Annales Academiae scientiarum fennicae*
AB *Anchor Bible*

ABD	<i>Anchor Bible Dictionary</i> . Edited by D. N. Freedman. 6 vols. New York, 1992
ABR	<i>Australian Biblical Review</i>
ABRL	Anchor Bible Reference Library
AGJU	Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums
AJEC	Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity
AJSR	<i>Association of Jewish Studies Review</i>
AnBib	Analecta biblica
ANF	<i>Ante-Nicene Fathers: The Writings of the Fathers down to A.D. 325</i> . Edited by A. Roberts and J. Donaldson. Revised by A. C. Coxe. 10 vols. Repr., Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1978
AnGreg	Analecta Gregorianum
ANRW	<i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung</i> . Edited by H. Temporini and W. Haase. Berlin, 1972–
ANTC	Abingdon New Testament Commentaries
ANTJ	Arbeiten zum Neuen Testament und Judentum
AR	<i>Archiv für Religionswissenschaft</i>
ASNU	Acta seminarii neotestamentici upsaliensis
ATANT	Abhandlungen zur Theologie des Alten und Neuen Testaments
ATLAMS	American Theological Library Association Monograph Series
ATM	Altes Testament und Moderne
AYB	The Anchor Yale Bible
BA	Berichte und Abhandlungen
BBB	Bonner biblische Beiträge
BBR	<i>Bulletin of Biblical Research</i>
BCNH	Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi
BDAG	Bauer, W., F. W. Danker, W. F. Arndt, and F. W. Gingrich. <i>Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature</i> . 3rd ed. Chicago, 2000
BDF	Blass, F., A. Debrunner, and R. W. Funk. <i>A Greek Grammar of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature</i> . Chicago, 1961
BECNT	Baker Exegetical Commentary on the New Testament
BETL	Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologiarum lovaniensium
BHM	<i>Bet ha-Midrash</i> . By A. Jellinek. 6 vols. Leipzig: C. W. Vollrath, 1853–77
Bib	<i>Biblica</i>
BibInt	<i>Biblical Interpretation</i>
BibSem	Biblical Seminar
BibTS	Biblical Tools and Studies
BIS	Biblical Interpretation Series
BJRL	<i>Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester</i>
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
BNTC	Black's New Testament Commentaries
BR	<i>Biblical Research</i>
BRev	<i>Bible Review</i>
BS	<i>Beth She'arim</i> . Vol. 2, <i>The Greek Inscriptions</i> . By M. Schwabe and B. Lifshitz. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1974
BT	<i>The Bible Translator</i>
BTSc	Biblisch-theologische Schwerpunkte
BTSt	Biblisch-theologische Studien
BU	Biblische Untersuchungen
BZ	<i>Biblische Zeitschrift</i>
BZAW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft

BZRG	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für Religions- und Geistesgeschichte
CahRB	Cahiers de la Revue biblique
CBET	Contributions to Biblical Theology and Exegesis
CBQ	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CBQMS	Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series
CBR	<i>Currents in Biblical Research</i>
CBT	Cultures, Beliefs and Traditions
CCCM	Corpus Christianorum: Continuatio mediaevalis. Turnhout, 1969–
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum: Series latina. Turnhout, 1953–
CEJL	Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature
CGTC	Cambridge Greek Testament Commentary
CIJ	Corpus inscriptionum judaicarum
ConBNT	Coniectanea neotestamentica or Coniectanea biblica: New Testament Series
ConBOT	Coniectanea biblica: Old Testament Series
CRINT	Compendia rerum iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum
CSCO	Corpus scriptorum christianorum orientalium. Edited by I. B. Chabot et al. Paris, 1903–
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum
CSHB	Corpus scriptorum historiae byzantinae
CSHR	Chicago Studies in the History of Religion
CTJ	<i>Calvin Theological Journal</i>
CTQ	<i>Concordia Theological Quarterly</i>
CV	<i>Communio viatorum</i>
DBM	<i>Deltion Bibliikon Meleton</i>
DCLY	Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook
DHRP	Dissertationes ad historiam religionum pertinentes
DJD	Discoveries in the Judaean Desert
DJG	<i>Dictionary of Jesus and the Gospels</i> . Edited by J. B. Green and S. McKnight. Downers Grove, IL, 1992
DSD	<i>Dead Sea Discoveries</i>
EB	Echter Bibel
EBib	Etudes bibliques
EC	Epworth Commentaries
EDNT	<i>Exegetical Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . Edited by H. Balz and G. Schneider. 3 vols. Grand Rapids, 1990–93
EH	Europäische Hochschulschriften
EKKNT	Evangelisch-katholischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
EPRO	Etudes préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l’empire romain
Erlsr	<i>Eretz-Israel</i>
ETL	<i>Ephemerides theologicae lovanienses</i>
ETS	Erfurter theologische Studien
EvQ	<i>Evangelical Quarterly</i>
EvT	<i>Evangelische Theologie</i>
ExpTim	<i>Expository Times</i>
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
FB	Forschung zur Bibel
FRLANT	Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
FZPhTh	<i>Freiburger Zeitschrift für Philosophie und Theologie</i>
GCS	Die griechische christliche Schriftsteller der ersten [drei] Jahrhunderte
GNS	Good News Studies
GP	Gospel Perspectives
GTA	Göttinger theologischer Arbeiten

GTF	Greifswalder theologische Forschungen
HBS	Herders biblische Studien
<i>HBT</i>	<i>Horizons in Biblical Theology</i>
HCOT	Historical Commentary on the Old Testament
HDR	Harvard Dissertations in Religion
HNT	Handbuch zum Neuen Testament
<i>HR</i>	<i>History of Religions</i>
<i>HSCP</i>	<i>Harvard Studies in Classical Philology</i>
HSem	Horae semiticae. 9 vols. London, 1908–12
HSM	Harvard Semitic Monographs
HSS	Harvard Semitic Studies
HTKAT	Herders theologischer Kommentar zum Alten Testament
HTKNT	Herders theologischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
<i>HTR</i>	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
<i>HUCA</i>	<i>Hebrew Union College Annual</i>
HUT	Hermeneutische Untersuchungen zur Theologie
<i>HvTSt</i>	<i>Hervormde theologiese studies</i>
ICC	International Critical Commentary
IDB	<i>The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible</i> . Edited by G. A. Buttrick. 4 vols. Nashville, 1962
<i>IDBSup</i>	<i>The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible: Supplementary Volume</i> . Edited by K. Crim. Nashville, 1976
<i>IEJ</i>	<i>Israel Exploration Journal</i>
<i>IMJ</i>	<i>Israel Museum Journal</i>
<i>Int</i>	<i>Interpretation</i>
ISFCJ	International Studies in Formative Christianity and Judaism (University of South Florida)
ITS	International Theological Studies
JAOS	<i>Journal of the American Oriental Society</i>
Jastrow	Jastrow, M. <i>A Dictionary of the Targumim, the Talmud Babli and Yerushalmi, and the Midrashic Literature</i> . 2nd ed. New York, 1903
<i>JBL</i>	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JBT	Jahrbuch für biblische Theologie
JC	Judaica et Christiana
JCR	<i>Journal of Contemporary Religion</i>
JECS	<i>Journal of Early Christian Studies</i>
JEH	<i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i>
JIGRE	<i>Jewish Inscriptions of Graeco-Roman Egypt, with an Index of the Jewish Inscriptions of Egypt and Cyrenaica</i> . By William Horbury and David Noy. Cambridge, 1992
<i>JiWE</i>	<i>Jewish Inscriptions of Western Europe</i> . By David Noy. 2 vols. Cambridge, 1993–95
<i>JJRS</i>	<i>Japanese Journal of Religious Studies</i>
<i>JJS</i>	<i>Journal of Jewish Studies</i>
<i>JJSoc</i>	<i>Jewish Journal of Sociology</i>
<i>JQR</i>	<i>Jewish Quarterly Review</i>
JR	<i>Journal of Religion</i>
JRS	<i>Journal of Roman Studies</i>
<i>JSHJ</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the Historical Jesus</i>
<i>JSJ</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic and Roman Period</i>
<i>JSJSup</i>	Journal for the Study of Judaism: Supplement Series
<i>JSNT</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the New Testament</i>

JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament: Supplement Series
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament: Supplement Series
<i>JSP</i>	<i>Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha</i>
JSPSup	Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha: Supplement Series
<i>JSQ</i>	<i>Jewish Studies Quarterly</i>
<i>JSSR</i>	<i>Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion</i>
<i>JTC</i>	<i>Journal for Theology and the Church</i>
<i>JTS</i>	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
KAV	Kommentar zu den Apostolischen Vätern
KBANT	Kommentare und Beiträge zum Alten und Neuen Testament
<i>KD</i>	<i>Kerygma und Dogma</i>
KEK	Kritisch-exegetischer Kommentar über das Neue Testament (Meyer-Kommentar)
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LD	Lectio divina
LHB	Library of Hebrew Bible
LNTS	Library of New Testament Studies
LRC	Library of Religion and Culture
<i>LS</i>	<i>Louvain Studies</i>
LSAAR	Lund Studies in African and Asian Religions
LSJ	Liddell, H. G., R. Scott, and H. S. Jones. <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. with revised supplement. Oxford, 1996
LTT	Library of Theological Translations
MBCBSup	Mnemosyne, bibliotheca classica Batava: Supplementum
MdB	Le Monde de la Bible
MTS	Marburger theologische Studien
<i>Mus</i>	<i>Muséon: Revue d'études orientales</i>
NCB	New Century Bible
<i>Neot</i>	<i>Neotestamentica</i>
NGS	New Gospel Studies
NHMS	Nag Hammadi and Manichaean Studies
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NIGTC	New International Greek Testament Commentary
<i>NJahrb</i>	<i>Neue Jahrbücher für das klassische Altertum</i>
<i>NovT</i>	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NovTSup	Novum Testamentum Supplements
NTAbh	Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen
NTG	New Testament Guides
NTL	New Testament Library
NTOA	Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus
<i>NTS</i>	<i>New Testament Studies</i>
NTTS	New Testament Tools and Studies
<i>NV</i>	<i>Nova et vetera</i>
OBO	Orbis biblicus et orientalis
OECT	Oxford Early Christian Texts
ÖTKNT	Ökumenischer Taschenbuch-Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
OTL	Old Testament Library
<i>OTP</i>	<i>The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha</i> . Edited by J. H. Charlesworth. 2 vols. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1983–85
OTS	Old Testament Studies
OtSt	Oudtestamentische Studiën
<i>OtSt</i>	<i>Oudtestamentische Studiën</i>
PAPS	<i>Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society</i>

PG	Patrologia graeca [= Patrologiae cursus completus: Series graeca]. Edited by J.-P. Migne. 166 vols. Paris, 1857–66
PGL	<i>Patristic Greek Lexicon</i> . Edited by G. W. H. Lampe. Oxford, 1968
PGM	<i>Papyri graecae magicae: Die griechischen Zauberpapyri</i> . Edited by K. Preisendanz. Berlin, 1928
PIBA	<i>Proceedings of the Irish Biblical Association</i>
PiNNTC	Pillar New Testament Commentary
PL	Patrologia latina [= Patrologiae cursus completus: Series latina]. Edited by J.-P. Migne. 221 vols. Paris, 1844–65
PNMES	Publications in Near and Middle East Studies (Columbia University)
PNTC	Pelican New Testament Commentaries
PO	Patrologia orientalis
PRSt	<i>Perspectives in Religious Studies</i>
PS	Patrologia syriaca. Rev. ed. I. Ortiz de Urbina. Rome, 1965
PTMS	Princeton Theological Monograph Series
QD	Quaestiones disputatae
RBL	<i>Review of Biblical Literature</i>
RCatT	<i>Revista catalana de teologia</i>
REJ	<i>Revue des études juives</i>
RestQ	<i>Restoration Quarterly</i>
RevB	<i>Revue biblique</i>
RevQ	<i>Revue de Qumran</i>
RHPR	<i>Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses</i>
RHR	<i>Revue de l'histoire des religions</i>
RM	Die Religionen der Menschheit
RNT	Regensburger Neues Testament
RRelRes	<i>Review of Religious Research</i>
RRJ	<i>Review of Rabbinic Judaism</i>
RSO	Religion and the Social Order
RSR	<i>Recherches de science religieuse</i>
RTR	<i>Reformed Theological Review</i>
SBA	Stuttgarter biblische Aufsatzbände
SBEC	Studies in the Bible and Early Christianity
SBL	Studies in Biblical Literature
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBLEJL	Society of Biblical Literature Early Judaism and Its Literature
SBLMS	Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series
SBLSCS	Society of Biblical Literature Septuagint and Cognate Series
SBLSS	Society of Biblical Literature Semeia Studies
SBLSymS	Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series
SBS	Stuttgarter Bibelstudien
SBT	Studies in Biblical Theology
SC	Sources chrétiennes. Paris: Cerf, 1943–
SCI	<i>Scripta Classica Israelica</i>
SCJ	Studies in Christianity and Judaism
ScrHier	Scripta hierosolymitana
SemeiaSt	Semeia Studies
SESJ	Suomen eksegeettisen seuran julkaisu
SHBC	Smyth & Helwys Bible Commentary
SHR	Studies in the History of Religions
SJ	Studia judaica
SJLA	Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity
SJSHRZ	Studien zu den jüdischen Schriften aus hellenistisch-römischer Zeit
SJT	<i>Scottish Journal of Theology</i>

SKKNT	Stuttgarter kleiner Kommentar, Neues Testament
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
SNTSU	Studien zum Neuen Testament und seiner Umwelt
SNTW	Studies in the New Testament and Its World
SO	<i>Symbolae Osloenses</i>
<i>SocRel</i>	<i>Sociology of Religion</i>
SOTSMS	Society for Old Testament Studies Monograph Series
SSN	Studia semitica neerlandica
StA	Studienhefte zur Altertumswissenschaft
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
StPB	Studia post-biblica
Str-B	Strack, H. L., and P. Billerbeck. <i>Kommentar zum Neuen Testament aus Talmud und Midrasch</i> . 6 vols. Munich: Beck, 1922–61
StSin	Studia Sinaitica
SUNT	Studien zur Umwelt des Neuen Testaments
SVTP	Studia in Veteris Testamenti pseudepigraphica
SWBA	Social World of Biblical Antiquity
TANZ	Texte und Arbeiten zum neutestamentlichen Zeitalter
TAPA	<i>Transactions of the American Philological Association</i>
TB	Theologische Bücherei: Neudrucke und Berichte aus dem 20. Jahrhundert
TBN	Themes in Biblical Narrative
TDNT	<i>Theological Dictionary of the New Testament</i> . Edited by G. Kittel and G. Friedrich. Translated by G. W. Bromiley. 10 vols. Grand Rapids, 1964–76
TDOT	<i>Theological Dictionary of the Old Testament</i> . Edited by G. J. Botterweck and H. Ringgren. Translated by J. T. Willis, G. W. Bromiley, and D. E. Green. 14 vols. Grand Rapids, 1974–
TEH	Theologische Existenz heute
TF	Texte zur Forschung
ThBT	Theologische Bibliothek Töpelmann
<i>ThG</i>	<i>Theologie der Gegenwart</i>
<i>ThGl</i>	<i>Theologie und Glaube</i>
THKNT	Theologischer Handkommentar zum Neuen Testament
<i>ThQ</i>	<i>Theologische Quartalschrift</i>
<i>ThTo</i>	<i>Theology Today</i>
TJT	<i>Toronto Journal of Theology</i>
TLG	<i>Thesaurus linguae graecae: Canon of Greek Authors and Works</i> . Edited by L. Berkowitz and K. A. Squitier. 3rd ed. Oxford, 1990
TLZ	<i>Theologische Literaturzeitung</i>
TQ	<i>Theologische Quartalschrift</i>
TRSR	Testi e ricerche di scienze religiose
TRu	<i>Theologische Rundschau</i>
TS	Texts and Studies
TS	<i>Theological Studies</i>
TSAJ	Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum
TSS	Theological Seminar Series
TU	Texte und Untersuchungen
<i>TynBul</i>	<i>Tyndale Bulletin</i>
TZ	<i>Theologische Zeitschrift</i>
UNT	Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
USQR	<i>Union Seminary Quarterly Review</i>
Vat. gr.	Vaticani graeci
VC	<i>Vigiliae christianae</i>

VCSup	Vigiliae christianae Supplements
VD	<i>Verbum domini</i>
VT	<i>Vetus Testamentum</i>
VTSup	Vetus Testamentum Supplements
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WBS	Wiener byzantinistische Studien
WMANT	Wissenschaftliche Monographien zum Alten und Neuen Testament
WPC	Westminster Pelican Commentaries
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZBK	Zürcher Bibelkommentare
ZDMG	<i>Zeitschrift der deutschen morgenländischen Gesellschaft</i>
ZNT	<i>Zeitschrift für Neues Testament</i>
ZNTb/JHMT	<i>Zeitschrift für neuere Theologiegeschichte / Journal for the History of Modern Theology</i>
ZNW	<i>Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche</i>
ZPE	<i>Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik</i>
ZTK	<i>Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche</i>

1

The General and the Particular

Memories of Jesus

I wept for memory.

—Christina Rossetti

The frailty of human memory should distress all who quest for the so-called historical Jesus. Even were one to hold, as I do not, that eyewitnesses or companions of eyewitnesses composed the canonical Gospels, our critical work would remain.¹ Personal reminiscence is neither innocent nor objective.² Observers habitually misperceive, and they unavoidably misremember. As Thucydides remarked long ago, “Different eyewitnesses give different accounts

1. A notable recent attempt to link the canonical Gospels closely to eyewitness testimony is Richard Bauckham, *Jesus and the Eyewitnesses: The Gospels as Eyewitness Testimony* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2006). Although he is, in my view, overly optimistic about the reliability of the tradition, and although I believe that the Gospels are further removed from eyewitness testimony than does he, Bauckham engages some of the modern scientific literature on memory. For discussions of his book, see the multiple review articles in *JSHJ* 6, no. 2 (2008); *NV* 6, no. 3 (2008).

2. According to C. D. Broad, although “George IV used to say that he remembered leading a charge at the Battle of Waterloo, . . . there is every reason to believe that he was never within a hundred miles of the battle” (*The Mind and Its Place in Nature* [London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner, 1925], 231). For an entertaining collection of eyewitness fictions, see Malcolm Muggeridge, “The Eye-Witness Fallacy,” *Encounter* (May 1961): 86–89. For an introduction to the topic of self-deception from a psychological point of view, see Roy F. Baumeister, “Lying to Oneself: The Enigma of Self-Deception,” in *Lying and Deception in Everyday Life* (ed. Michael Lewis and Carolyn Saarni; New York: Guilford, 1993), 166–83.

of the same events, speaking out of partiality for one side or the other or else from imperfect memories” (*Hist.* 1.22).

Because human memory “leaks and dissociates,”³ all of us are, to one degree or another, fabulists, even when we try not to be.⁴ As modern research abundantly documents, memory often leads us astray.⁵ Among its many sins are the following, all of which matter for sober, honest study of Jesus:

1. To recollect is not to play back a tape. Memory, at least long-term memory, is reconstructive as well as reproductive⁶ and so involves imagination.⁷ This is how it can come to be that, with the passage of time, memories often move from a participant’s viewpoint to an outsider’s viewpoint; that is, we often recall events as though we had been a spectator off to the side.⁸

Remembering is not like reading a book but rather like writing a book.⁹ If there are blanks, we fill them in. If the plot is thin, we fill it out.¹⁰ As we constantly revise our memoirs, we may well recollect what we assume was

3. Sue Halpern, *Can’t Remember What I Forgot: The Good News from the Front Lines of Memory Research* (New York: Harmony Books, 2008), 4.

4. On the phenomenon of confabulation, which all of us engage in routinely, see William Hirstein, *Brain Fiction: Self-Deception and the Riddle of Confabulation* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2005). For a convenient, brief overview of the subject, see Helen Phillips, “Mind Fiction: Why Your Brain Tells Tall Tales,” *New Scientist* 2572 (October 7, 2008): 32–36.

5. For general introductions to the fallibility of human memory, see Alan Baddeley, Michael W. Eysenck, and Michael C. Anderson, *Memory* (New York: Psychology Press, 2009), 317–42; Daniel L. Schacter, “Memory Distortion: History and Current Status,” in *Memory Distortion: How Minds, Brains, and Societies Reconstruct the Past* (ed. Daniel L. Schacter; Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), 1–43; idem, *The Seven Sins of Memory: How the Mind Forgets and Remembers* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 2001); John Henderson, *Memory and Forgetting* (London: Routledge, 1999).

6. “Reproductive memory refers to accurate, rote production of material from memory, whereas reconstructive memory emphasizes the active process of filling in missing elements while remembering, with errors frequently occurring” (Henry L. Roediger III and Kathleen B. McDermott, “Creating False Memories: Remembering Words Not Presented in Lists,” *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition* 21 [1995]: 804).

7. The classic work is F. C. Bartlett, *Remembering: A Study in Experiment and Social Psychology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1932).

8. See William F. Brewer, “What Is Recollective Memory?” in *Remembering Our Past: Studies in Autobiographical Memory* (ed. David C. Rubin; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 27–28, 37.

9. I borrow this analogy from John F. Kihlstrom, “Memory, Autobiography, History” (online: <http://socrates.berkeley.edu/~kihlstrm/rmpa00.htm> [cited 18 November 2009]). Gayle Greene observes, “Memory is a creative writer, Mother of the Muses . . . maker of stories—the stories by which we construct meaning through temporality and assure ourselves that time past is not time lost” (“Feminist Fiction and the Uses of Memory,” *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 16 [1991]: 294).

10. See Halpern, *Can’t Remember*, 66. Ulric Neisser offers this analogy: we work with memories in the way that paleontologists work with bones: from a few pieces of bone, we reconstruct the original animal (*Cognitive Psychology* [New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1967], 285).

the case rather than what was in fact the case;¹¹ and as we confuse thought with deed, we may suppose we did something that we only entertained doing. In addition, we regularly mingle related or repeated events,¹² so the memory of a single occurrence is often composite, “a synthesis of experiences,”¹³ the upshot of “an abstractive process based on selective attention”¹⁴ or “schematic processing.”¹⁵ When asked, for instance, to recall last year’s Thanksgiving, people typically borrow details from what they otherwise know about the holiday in general. In this way, one event blends in with other events.¹⁶

2. “Postevent information often becomes incorporated into memory, supplementing and altering a person’s recollection,”¹⁷ so much so that people can “remember” events that they never experienced.¹⁸ Just hearing about a purported incident can lead us to believe that we actually saw it, a phenomenon sometimes dubbed “retroactive interference.”¹⁹ In like manner, even when we have beheld

11. See Roediger and McDermott, “Creating False Memories,” 803–14; Michael Ross, “Reliation of Implicit Theories to the Construction of Personal Histories,” *Psychological Review* 96, no. 2 (1989): 341–57.

12. Craig R. Barclay, “Schematization of Autobiographical Memory,” in *Autobiographical Memory* (ed. David C. Rubin; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 82–99; Marigold Linton, “Transformations of Memory in Everyday Life,” in *Memory Observed: Remembering in Natural Contexts* (ed. Ulric Neisser; New York: W. H. Freeman, 1982), 77–91; Ulric Neisser, “John Dean’s Memory: A Case Study,” *Cognition* 9 (1981): 1–22.

13. Elizabeth Loftus, “Our Changeable Memories: Legal and Practical Implications,” *Nature Reviews: Neuroscience* 4 (2003): 231.

14. Richard Luftig, “Abstractive Memory, the Central-Incidental Hypothesis, and the Use of Structure Importance in Text: Control Processes or Structural Features?” *Reading Research Quarterly* 19 (1983): 29. See further B. R. Gornicki, “Recall as an Abstractive Process,” *Acta Psychologica* 12 (1956): 77–94.

15. George A. Bonanno, “Remembering and Psychotherapy,” *Psychotherapy* 27 (1990): 177. See further John D. Bransford and Jeffery J. Franks, “The Abstraction of Linguistic Ideas,” *Cognitive Psychology* 2 (1971): 331–50.

16. Schacter, *Seven Sins*, 14–15. For a summary of the secondary literature on “relatedness effects” in memory, see Henry L. Roediger III and Kathleen B. McDermott, “Distortions of Memory,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Memory* (ed. Endel Tulving and Fergus I. M. Craik; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 151–53.

17. Elizabeth F. Loftus, James A. Coan, and Jacqueline E. Pickrell, “Manufacturing False Memories Using Bits of Reality,” in *Implicit Memory and Metacognition* (ed. Lynne M. Reder; Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1996), 197.

18. In addition to the classic treatise by Hugo Münsterberg, *On the Witness Stand: Essays on Psychology and Crime* (New York: Doubleday, Page, 1909; online: <http://psychclassics.yorku.ca/Munster/Witness> [cited 18 November 2009]), see the extensive review of the literature in C. J. Brainerd and V. F. Reyna, *The Science of False Memory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005). For briefer, helpful overviews, see Elizabeth F. Loftus, “Make-Believe Memories,” *American Psychologist* 58 (2003): 867–73; Elizabeth F. Loftus and Daniel M. Bernstein, “Rich False Memories: The Royal Road to Success,” in *Experimental Cognitive Psychology and Its Applications* (ed. Alice F. Healy; Washington, DC: American Psychological Association, 2005), 101–13.

19. Stephen J. Ceci et al., “Repeatedly Thinking about a Non-event: Source Misattributions among Preschoolers,” *Consciousness and Cognition* 3 (1994): 388–407; Lynn M. Goff and Henry L. Roediger III, “Imagination Inflation for Action Events: Repeated Imaginings Lead to

something for ourselves, our own memory, under social pressure, may conform itself to the expectations of others or to their erroneous recall.²⁰

3. We are apt to project present circumstances and biases onto our past experiences, assimilating our former selves to our present selves.²¹ We may, for example, assume that we once believed what we have believed only of late and distort our recall accordingly.²² “Surely it must have been like this” readily becomes “It was so.”²³ Similarly, our moral judgments may amend our memories. We may confuse what we think ought to have occurred with what did occur.²⁴

Illusory Recollections,” *Memory and Cognition* 26 (1998): 20–33; Elizabeth Loftus, “Planting Misinformation in the Human Mind: A 30-Year Investigation of the Malleability of Memory,” *Learning and Memory* 12 (2005): 361–66; Elizabeth Loftus and J. E. Pickrell, “The Formation of False Memories,” *Psychiatric Annals* 25 (1995): 720–25; Stefanie J. Sharman, Maryanne Garry, and Carl J. Beuke, “Imagination or Exposure Causes Imagination Inflation,” *American Journal of Psychology* 117 (2004): 157–68; Ayanna K. Thomas and Elizabeth Loftus, “Creating Bizarre False Memories through Imagination,” *Memory and Cognition* 30 (2002): 423–31; Giuliana A. L. Mazzoni, Elizabeth F. Loftus, and Irving Kirsch, “Changing Beliefs about Implausible Autobiographical Events: A Little Plausibility Goes a Long Way,” *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Applied* 7 (2001): 51–59.

20. Saul M. Kassin and Katherine L. Kiechel, “The Social Psychology of False Confessions: Compliance, Internalization, and Confabulation,” *Psychological Science* 7 (1996): 125–28; Elizabeth F. Loftus, “Illusions of Memory,” *PAPS* 142, no. 1 (1998): 60–73; Henry L. Roediger III, Michelle L. Meade, and Erik T. Bergman, “Social Contagion of Memory,” *Psychonomic Bulletin and Review* 8, no. 2 (2001): 365–71; Roediger and McDermott, “Distortions of Memory,” 157–58; Lawrence Wright, *Remembering Satan* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1994). Bartlett already recognized that “social organization gives a persistent framework into which all detailed recall must fit, and it very powerfully influences both the manner and the matter of recall” (*Remembering*, 296).

21. This is known as “hindsight bias” or the “bias of retrospection.” See Deborah Davis and Elizabeth F. Loftus, “Internal and External Sources of Misinformation in Adult Witness Memory,” in *Memory for Events* (vol. 1 of *Handbook of Eyewitness Psychology*, ed. Michael P. Toglia et al.; Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2007), 206–7, 218; Scott A. Hawkins and Reid Hastie, “Hindsight: Biased Judgments of Past Events after the Outcomes Are Known,” *Psychological Bulletin* 107 (1990): 311–27; Linda J. Levine, “Reconstructing Memory for Emotions,” *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General* 126 (1997): 165–77; Barrett J. Mandel, “Full of Life Now,” in *Autobiography: Essays Theoretical and Critical* (ed. James Olney; Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1980), 49–72; G. B. Markus, “Stability and Change in Political Attitudes: Observed, Recalled, and ‘Explained,’” *Political Behavior* 8 (1986): 21–44; A. E. Wilson and M. Ross, “The Identity Function of Autobiographical Memory: Time Is on Our Side,” *Memory* 11 (2003): 137–49.

22. Markus, “Stability and Change”; C. R. Brewin, B. Andrews, and I. H. Gotlib, “Psychopathology and Early Experience: A Reappraisal of Retrospective Reports,” *Psychological Bulletin* 113 (1993): 82–98; R. M. Dawes, “Biases of Retrospection,” *Issues in Child Abuse Accusations* 1 (1991): 25–28; George R. Goethals and Richard F. Reckman, “Recalling Previously Held Attitudes,” *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 9 (1973): 491–501.

23. John Robinson comments, “Anything that alters the way a past experience is interpreted would alter what a person remembers from that experience” (“Perspective, Meaning, and Remembering,” in *Remembering Our Past* [ed. Rubin], 209).

24. David A. Pazarro et al., “Ripple Effects in Memory: Judgments of Moral Blame Can Distort Memory for Events,” *Memory and Cognition* 34 (2006): 550–55.

4. Although time's passage may add perspective, memories are not evergreen; they become less and less distinct as the past recedes. Weeks, months, and years dim lucidity, reduce detail, and diminish emotional intensity.²⁵ Output does not match input.²⁶

5. Memories are subject to sequential displacement. We often move remembered events forward and backward in time.²⁷ "Temporal judgments . . . appear to be highly reconstructive."²⁸

6. Individuals transmute memories into meaningful patterns that advance their agendas.²⁹ Collectives do likewise.³⁰ We remember publicly in order to

25. Introspection alone reveals that memories become "dim," "unclear," "simplified." See Brewer, "What Is Recollective Memory?" 23–24. Note also this remark by Bertrand Russell: "Memory is trustworthy in proportion to the vividness of the experience and its nearness in time. . . . Thus there is a continual gradation in the degree of self-evidence of what I remember, and a corresponding gradation in the trustworthiness of my memory" (*The Problems of Philosophy* [New York: Oxford University Press, 1959], 115–16). Emotion matters because memory of a particular event can improve when one's emotional state during recall is congruent with what it was when the event transpired (see Alan Baddeley, *Human Memory: Theory and Practice* [Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1990], 390–97). But note this generalization by Daniel Reisberg and Friderike Heuer: "Emotion improves memory for some sorts of material and undermines memory for other material. Emotion seems to slow forgetting. Emotion creates an interesting species of intrusion errors in recall testing" ("Remembering the Details of Emotional Events," in *Affect and Accuracy in Recall: Studies of "Flashbulb" Memories* [ed. Eugene Winograd and Ulric Neisser; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992], 185). For a survey of the issues, see Daniel L. Schacter, David A. Gallo, and Elizabeth A. Kensinger, "The Cognitive Neuroscience of Implicit and False Memories: Perspectives on Processing Specificity," in *The Foundations of Remembering: Essays in Honor of Henry L. Roediger III* (ed. James S. Nairne; New York: Psychology Press, 2007), 353–77.

26. See H. Schmolck, E. A. Buffalo, and L. R. Squire, "Memory Distortions Develop over Time: Recollections of the O. J. Simpson Trial Verdict after 15 and 32 Months," *Psychological Science* 11 (2000): 39–45; Michael Schudson, "Dynamics of Distortion in Collective Memory," in *Memory Distortion* (ed. Schacter), 346–64. Charles P. Thompson et al. observe, "Event memory is initially highly reproductive but becomes increasingly reconstructive with lengthening retention interval" (*Autobiographical Memory: Remembering What and Remembering When* [Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1996], 204).

27. Norman R. Brown, Lance J. Rips, and Steven K. Shevell, "Subjective Dates of Natural Events in Very Long-Term Memory," *Cognitive Psychology* 17 (1985): 139–77; George D. Gaskell, Daniel B. Wright, and Colm A. O'Muircheartaigh, "Telescoping of Landmark Events: Implications for Survey Research," *Public Opinion Quarterly Review* 64 (2000): 77–89.

28. So Thompson et al., *Autobiographical Memory*, 204. Morris Moscovitch remarks, "Temporal order . . . is conferred on recovered traces only on retrieval" ("Confabulation," in *Memory Distortion* [ed. Schacter], 246).

29. Memories are "transmuted re-creations," part of "our continued efforts to make coherence of our own lives, to synthesize past and present so as to face the future" (Steven Rose, *The Making of Memory: From Molecules to Mind* [New York: Doubleday, 1992], 307). For a valuable illustration, see Laura A. Smoller, "Miracle, Memory, and Meaning in the Canonization of Vincent Ferrer, 1453–1454," *Speculum* 73 (1998): 429–54.

30. Ever since the work of the French sociologist Maurice Halbwachs in the 1920s, there has been a large literature on social or collective memory, most of which emphasizes the social frameworks and social interests of memory. For a convenient introduction to Halbwachs, see

persuade, to justify ourselves, and to explain current circumstances.³¹ In other words, memories are a function of self-interest, and we instinctively revise them in order to help maintain “a meaningful sense of self-identity.”³²

Alfred Adler wrote, “There are no ‘chance memories’: out of the incalculable number of impressions which meet an individual, he chooses to remember only those which he feels, however darkly, to have a bearing on his situation.”³³ Utilizing the past to promote current interests—the classical form critics saw this on every page of the canonical Gospels—leads to alteration, because those interests, a component of which is often entertainment, cannot help affecting both the content and interpretation of what one retrieves from memory.³⁴ Susan Engel offers an effective example:

his book *The Collective Memory* (trans. Francis J. Ditter Jr. and Vida Yazdi Ditter; 1950; repr., New York: Harper & Row, 1980). For a helpful bibliography, see online: www.phil.mq.edu.au/staff/jsutton/Socialmemory.htm (cited 18 November 2009); and for overviews of the discussion, see Jeffrey K. Olick and Joyce Robbins, “Social Memory Studies: From ‘Collective Memory’ to the Historical Sociology of Mnemonic Practices,” *Annual Review of Sociology* 24 (1998): 105–40; Schudson, “Dynamics of Distortion.” Particularly important works include Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983); Michael Kammen, *Mystic Chords of Memory: The Transformation of Tradition in American Culture* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1991); Jacques Le Goff, *History and Memory* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1992); Edward Shils, *Tradition* (London: Faber, 1981). For some necessary corrections, see Noa Gedi and Yigal Elam, “Collective Memory—What Is It?” *History and Memory* 8 (1996): 30–50; Wulf Kansteiner, “Finding Meaning in Memory: A Methodological Critique of Collective Memory Studies,” *History and Theory* 41 (2002): 179–97; for the larger cultural currents that have led to the boon of studies on social memory, see Kerwin Lee Klein, “On the Emergence of Memory in Historical Discourse,” *Representations* 69 (2000): 127–50. Recent attempts to apply theory of social memory to religious history and/or early Christianity include Jan Assmann, *Religion and Cultural Memory: Ten Studies* (trans. Rodney Livingstone; Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2006); Markus Bockmuehl, *Seeing the Word: Refocusing New Testament Study* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2006), 161–88; Alan Kirk and Tom Thatcher, eds., *Memory, Tradition, and Text: Uses of the Past in Early Christianity* (SBLSymS 52; Boston: Brill, 2005); Anthony Le Donne, *The Historiographical Jesus: Memory, Typology, and the Son of David* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2009); idem, “Theological Memory Distortion in the Jesus Tradition: A Study in Social Memory Theory,” in *Memory in the Bible and Antiquity: The Fifth Durham-Tübingen Research Symposium* (ed. Stephen C. Barton, Loren T. Stuckenbruck, and Benjamin G. Wold; WUNT 212; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2007), 163–78; Rafael Rodríguez, “Structuring Early Christian Memory: Jesus in Tradition, Performance, and Text” (PhD diss., University of Sheffield, 2007).

31. Ross, “Implicit Theories.”

32. Greg J. Neimeyer and April E. Metzler, “Personal Identity and Autobiographical Recall,” in *The Remembering Self: Construction and Accuracy in the Self-Narrative* (ed. Ulric Neisser and Robyn Fivush; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 129.

33. Alfred Adler, “Early Recollections and Dreams,” in *The Individual Psychology of Alfred Adler* (ed. Heinz L. Ansbacher and Rowena R. Ansbacher; New York: Harper & Row, 1956), 351. All therapists know that what one recalls of the past says much about one’s present state.

34. See Levine, “Reconstructing Memory”; Wilson and Ross, “Identity Function.” One of the results of recent work is that we tend to report our past selves as inferior to our present